# Membership in International Organizations

### Gerd Droesse

# Membership in International Organizations

Paradigms of Membership Structures, Legal Implications of Membership and the Concept of International Organization





Gerd Droesse Vienna, Austria

ISBN 978-94-6265-326-9 ISBN 978-94-6265-327-6 (eBook) https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-327-6

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2020

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany



## **Preface**

The idea to write a book on *Membership in International Organizations* came to me when I worked on the book *Funds for Development: Multilateral Channels of Concessional Financing* (2011), of which I am the editor and main contributor. While working on that book, I analyzed in detail the membership frameworks of international financial institutions. At the time, I noticed many issues regarding the traditional concept of membership that, in my view, required amplification and revision.

While traditional concepts of membership are still relevant for international organizations with treaty foundation, they do not take into sufficient account the evolution of public international law and the emergence of new paradigms of organizational structures and institutional frameworks, not established by a treaty, and with membership structures which do not only, or predominantly, comprise states as members, or those without any formal membership structures. Considering these new paradigms, a wider definition of international organization and subject of international law is warranted.

It is also necessary for international organizations to open themselves to the outside by promoting institutionalized participation of a wide range of transnational actors. International organizations should become open and multi-level and multi-actor institutions that give a voice to a wide variety of stakeholders, which may include, in addition to states, sub-state actors, technical government agencies and regulatory agencies, private sector entities, and philanthropy and civil society.

This book, which is based on a doctoral thesis submitted at Hamburg University, seeks to address these issues in a holistic manner by highlighting the many links that exist between membership and concepts such as constitution and constitutionalization, subject of international law and international legal personality, as well as with organizations' institutional, capital and governance structures, representation arrangements and operational and funding modalities, and with the very concepts of "intergovernmental organization" and "international organization".

Vienna, Austria Gerd Droesse

# Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I wish to thank Prof. Dr. Armin Hatje for his support and his valuable suggestions, and Prof. Dr. Stefan Oeter and Prof. Dr. Markus Kotzur for their comments. I also wish to express my appreciation to Damien Eastwood, Assistant General Counsel; May Yap, Advisor (Finance); and Christopher L. Damandl, Senior Counsel, Asian Development Bank; Lisa Tabassi, Head, Legal Services, Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe; and Samy Ben-Jaffar, formerly Director, Private Sector Facility, Green Climate Fund, and currently, Chief Executive Officer, Dubai Green Fund, for their comments and suggestions. The advice of Doo-Sik Kim, Senior Partner and Haneul Jung, Senior Foreign Attorney of the Shin and Kim law firm in Seoul on matters of Korean law was much appreciated.

I also wish to thank Maricris Jan Tobias, Ruby Vitto, and Romina Grace B. Rosellon for their help in finalizing the book, and Janette Husmillo and the staff of the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg for their support.

# **Contents**

1	Intro	oduction	L	1		
	1.1	Traditi	ional Concepts of International Organization	1		
	1.2	Static	and Dynamic Concepts of International Organization	2		
	1.3	Early Developments Tie in with Recent Trends				
	1.4	Necess	sary Changes to Concepts of Membership and Subject			
		of Inte	rnational Law	4		
	1.5	Need f	for a New Definition of International Organization	5		
	1.6	Outlin	e of the Book	8		
	Refe	rences .		9		
2	Histo	oric Evo	lution of Membership Concepts	11		
	2.1		gence of International Organizations	11		
	2.2	Private	e International Unions	13		
	2.3	Interna	ational Administrative Unions	15		
		2.3.1	Creation of IAUs	15		
		2.3.2	Types and Structures of IAUs	17		
		2.3.3	Membership of IAUs	21		
	2.4	4 League of Nations				
		2.4.1	The League as a New Paradigm of International			
			Organization	29		
		2.4.2	Membership in the League	30		
		2.4.3	Preservation of Peace and Relations			
			with Non-Members	33		
		2.4.4	The League and the International Bureaux	34		
	2.5	UN Sy	ystem	35		
		2.5.1	United Nations	35		
		2.5.2	Specialized Agencies and Related Agencies	38		
		2.5.3	Subsidiary Organs and Quasi-Autonomous Bodies	43		
	2.6	Treaty	Bodies, Conferences of Parties and Financial			
		Mecha	nnisms	46		

xii Contents

	2.7 2.8	Proliferation, Privatization and Emergence of New		47			
	Refe		izational Paradigms	51 52			
3			International Organization and Membership	55			
	3.1		fications of Organizations	55			
		3.1.1	Public and Private Organizations	56			
		3.1.2	General and Special Organizations	57			
		3.1.3	Supranational and Other International Organizations	61			
		3.1.4	Classifications Based on Membership	64			
		3.1.5	Universal Organizations and Organizations of Global Reach	64			
		216	Designational Other Operations of Limited	04			
		3.1.6	Regional and Other Organizations of Limited	68			
	2.2	C 1	Membership				
	3.2		isions	77			
	3.3		ership, Participation, Representation and Related	70			
		-	pts	78			
		3.3.1	No Consistent Definition of Membership	78			
		3.3.2	Membership and Representation	83			
	Refe	rences .		87			
4		Decline or Disaggregation of the Nation State, Dichotomy of Public and Private and Constitution					
				89			
		Constitutionalization					
	4.1		Introduction				
	4.2		Decline or Disaggregation of the Nation State				
	4.3		ublic-Private and Governmental and Nongovernmental	0.5			
			tomies	95			
		4.3.1	The Public-Private Distinction	95			
		4.3.2	Implications for Organizations' Structure, Role and				
			Functions	103			
		4.3.3	External Cooperation with the Private Sector and				
			Institutionalized Participation	106			
		4.3.4	Funding Arrangements	108			
	4.4	Consti	tution and Constitutionalization	109			
		4.4.1	Treaty and Constitution	111			
		4.4.2	Hybrid Character of Constituent Agreements				
			Adopted as a Treaty	112			
		4.4.3	Consensual Basis and the Transformational				
			Potential of International Agreements	113			
		4.4.4	The Limited Relevance of the Treaty Format				
		4.4.5	Organizations Not Established by a Treaty				

Contents xiii

		4.4.6	Legal Implications of Constitutions Not Adopted	
			as a Treaty	120
		4.4.7	Examples of Constitutions Not Adopted	
			as a Treaty	120
		4.4.8	Rule of Law	122
		4.4.9	Constitutionalization	125
	Refe	rences .		129
5	Mem	bership	in International Organizations	133
	5.1		ganization Does Not Need to Have Members	134
		5.1.1	Membership Issues Cannot Be Reduced	
			to the Dichotomy of Treaty and Constitution	134
		5.1.2	Parties to Constituent Agreement Do Not Need	
		0.11.2	to Become Members	135
		5.1.3	Whether an Organization Needs to Have	100
		3.1.3	Members Depends on Its Functions	138
	5.2	Types	of Membership	145
	5.3		ets of Membership	147
	3.3	5.3.1	States, Countries, Nations and Governments	148
		5.3.2	International Organizations as Subjects	140
		3.3.2	of Membership	151
		5.3.3	Technical Government Agencies, Sub-State	131
		3.3.3	Actors and Regulatory Agencies as Subjects	
				153
		524	of Membership	153
		5.3.4 5.3.5	Dependent Territories as Subjects of Membership	133
		3.3.3	Corporations or Other Transnational Actors	160
		526	as Members of International Organizations	160
		5.3.6	Examples of Participation of Private-Sector	1.00
		<i>5.0.7</i>	Entities	160
		5.3.7	Private-Sector Entities Can Be Full Members	1.00
			of International Organizations	162
	5.4		ership Procedures	169
		5.4.1	Procedure May Prevail Over Substance	170
		5.4.2	Ratification Requirement of Constituent	
			Instruments	173
		5.4.3	Classification of Membership Procedures Based	
			on Complexity	177
		5.4.4	Classification of Membership Procedures Based	
			on Criteria for Admission to Membership	186
		5.4.5	Membership Procedures for Different Subjects	
			of Membership	189
		5.4.6	Asian Development Bank	192
		5.4.7	Caribbean Development Bank	196

xiv Contents

5.5		rawal, Suspension and Termination of Membership	197				
	5.5.1	Withdrawal	197				
	5.5.2	Suspension and Expulsion/Termination	400				
		of Membership	198				
5.6		ng of International Organizations to Non-members	200				
5.7		isions	201				
Refe	erences .		201				
	Subjects of International Law and International Legal						
	Personality						
6.1	•	ts of International Law	206				
	6.1.1	The Need for a Wider Concept of Subject					
		of International Law	206				
	6.1.2	Historical Connotations of Subjects of International					
		Law	208				
	6.1.3	Dual and Hybrid Organizations	211				
	6.1.4	Relationship of Subjects of International Law					
		and International Legal Personality	220				
	6.1.5	Organizations with Institutional Ambivalence					
		by Design as Subjects of International Law	223				
	6.1.6	Trust Funds as Subjects of International Law	230				
6.2		ational Legal Personality and Its Legal Implications	241				
	6.2.1	International Legal Personality Not a Requirement					
		for Membership	244				
	6.2.2	Consensual Basis of International Legal Personality					
		and Transformation of International Organizations	245				
	6.2.3	Non-Ratified Constitution Can Be the Basis					
		for International Action	246				
	6.2.4	International Legal Personality of Organizations					
		Incorporated Under National Law	248				
	6.2.5	Transformation of International Organization					
		Acquiring International Legal Personality	249				
	6.2.6	European Agencies	252				
	6.2.7	Quasi-Autonomous Bodies	261				
	6.2.8	Financial Mechanisms of Multilateral Environmental					
		Conventions as Subjects of International Law	266				
	6.2.9	Preparatory Commission of the Nuclear Test Ban					
		Organization (CTBTO)	270				
6.3	Conclu	isions	270				
Refe	erences .		271				

Contents xv

Changing Concepts of Intergovernmental Organization and International Organization				
7.1		ence of New Organizational Paradigms		
7.1	7.1.1	Progressive Institutionalization		
	7.1.2	Established by Resolution of a Conference		
	7.1.2	Adoption of Constitution by a Plenary Body		
	7.1.3	Established Based on National Law		
	7.1.4	Establishment by Conference or Meeting		
	7.1.5	of the Parties to a Convention		
	7.1.6	Dual and Hybrid Organizations Incorporated		
	7.1.0	Under National Law		
	7.1.7	Institutional Ambivalence by Design		
	7.1.7	Trust Funds		
	7.1.8	Conclusions		
7.2		roblematic Concept of Intergovernmental Organization		
1.2		ished by Intergovernmental Agreement		
	7.2.1	Traditional Concepts Require Adjustment		
	7.2.1	Need for a New Concept of Intergovernmental		
	1.2.2	Organization		
7.3	The C	oncept of "International Organization"		
1.5	7.3.1	Definitions of International Organization		
	7.3.1	in Literature		
	7.3.2	The Definition of an International Organization		
	1.3.2	as Proposed by the International Law Commission		
	7.3.3	Treaty or Instrument Governed by International		
	1.3.3	Law Is Not an Element of Definition		
	7.3.4	"International Organizations" are Defined		
	7.5.4	by Their Functions		
	7.3.5	The Dynamic Character of Intergovernmental		
	7.5.5	and International Organizations		
	7.3.6	Evolution of International Law		
Refe				
Mem		and Privileges and Immunities		
8.1	Paradi	gms for Extending Privileges and Immunities		
	8.1.1	Constituent Agreements and Multilateral		
		Conventions		
8.2		ny of Privileges and Immunities by National		
		ternational Courts		
	8.2.1	Immunity from Legal Process		
	8.2.2	Restrictions to Immunity for Commercial		
		Transactions		
	8.2.3	Other Attempts to Restrict Immunity		
		on Functional Grounds		

xvi Contents

	8.2.4	Immunity of Jurisdiction and Due Process	341		
	8.2.5	Possible Solutions	349		
8.3	Privile	ges and Immunities in Non-Member Countries	350		
8.4	Lacuna	a in the Provision of Privileges and Immunities	353		
	8.4.1	Possible Solutions	357		
Refe	rences		359		
Lega	l Implic	ations of Membership	361		
9.1		action	362		
9.2	Membe	ership and Representation	362		
	9.2.1	Legitimacy	363		
	9.2.2	Functionality and Inclusiveness of the Three-Tier			
		System	368		
	9.2.3	Strategic Focus, Resident Boards and Secondary			
		Governing Structures	374		
	9.2.4	From State-Centric to Multi-Actor Governance			
		Structures	376		
	9.2.5	The Alternative of a Two-Tier System			
		with an Accountability and Guidance Mechanism	379		
	9.2.6	Weighted and Non-weighted Voting Systems	383		
	9.2.7	Design Options and Policy Issues	387		
9.3	Fundin	ng Mechanisms, Organizational and Capital			
	Structures and Modalities of Financing of International				
	Organizations				
	9.3.1	Constraints of Current Funding Structures	387		
	9.3.2	Engagement with the Private Sector, Philanthropy			
		and Civil Society	389		
	9.3.3	Global Funding Mechanisms for Organizations			
		Producing Global Public Goods	391		
	9.3.4	Funding Mechanisms Based Exclusively or			
		Predominantly of Private Sector Funding	392		
	9.3.5	Membership and Capital Structures	393		
9.4	Membe	ership and Borrowings of International			
		zations	404		
9.5	Membe	ership, Operational Activities and Procurement	408		
	9.5.1	Membership and Eligibility to Receive Financing	408		
	9.5.2	Country Ownership, Private Sector			
		and No-Objection Procedure	409		
	9.5.3	State-Sector Bias in Project Implementation	410		
	9.5.4	Membership and Procurement	412		
9.6	Conclu	isions	413		
Refe	rences		414		

Contents xvii

New	Concept of International Organization	417
10.1	Theses	
10.2	New Analytical Framework for International Organization	422
	10.2.1 Requirements for Classification as "Organization"	422
	10.2.2 Political Autonomy and Institutional Independence	423
	10.2.3 Ability to Act on the International Plane	425
10.3	The Power of Creation Has Passed Over to International	
	Organizations and Other Actors	425
10.4	Future Challenges for International Organizations	427
	10.4.1 Opening of International Organizations	427
	10.4.2 The Evolution of the Architecture of International	
	Organizations	428
Refer	ences	430
		43
	10.1 10.2 10.3 10.4	10.2 New Analytical Framework for International Organization

#### **About the Author**

**Gerd Droesse** is a recognized specialist in institutional law, international administrative law, complex institutional and financial policy matters, and corporate governance issues, with more than 30 years of experience in working for international organizations. Dr. Droesse helped in facilitating the transition of the World Green Economy Organization to a new type of intergovernmental organization with treaty foundation.

Previously, he contributed to setting up the legal and institutional framework of the Green Climate Fund where he served as the Legal Counsel of the Interim Secretariat, Acting General Counsel, and Senior Advisor of the GCF. With the Asian Development Bank (ADB) he worked as Lead Specialist, Institution and Coordination (Director) in the Office of The Secretary, as the Legal Adviser of the Asian Development Bank Institute, and as Head of the Special Practice Group: Institutional and Administrative in the Office of the General Counsel.

With extensive experience in resource mobilization issues, funding mechanisms and innovative modalities of financing, and ability to conduct comprehensive reviews of Human Resources policies, he also contributed to the work of Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) of the United Nations as legal adviser to the Director of Personnel.

Dr. Droesse is qualified as a lawyer in Germany. He studied law and history at the universities of Würzburg (Germany) and Lausanne (Switzerland) and international relations at the Johns Hopkins SAIS Bologna Center in Italy and holds a Doctor of Law degree (*summa cum laude*) of Hamburg University. Dr. Droesse is the editor and main contributor of the book "Funds for Development: Multilateral Channels of Concessional Financing" which was launched in 2011 at the National University of Singapore and has contributed chapters to four books. Currently, he teaches "Law of International Organizations" at the Paris School of International Affairs (SciencesPo).

## **Abbreviations**

ADB Asian Development Bank AfDB African Development Bank

AIIB Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank
AMRO ASEAN+3 Macroeconomic Research Office
ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ASEAN+3 ASEAN + China, Japan, South Korea (ASEAN+3) BCIE Central American Bank for Economic Integration

BIS Bank for International Settlements
CAF Corporación Andina de Fomento
CDB Caribbean Development Bank
CDM Clean Development Mechanism

CEDARE Programme for the Arab Region and Europe

CER Certified Emission Reductions

CGIAR Consultative Group for International Agricultural Research

CGIF Credit Guarantee and Investment Facility

CoE Council of Europe

COP Conference of the Parties

CPISA Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the

Specialized Agencies

CSCE Conference for Security and Co-operation in Europe

CTBT Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty

CTBTO Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty Organization

DAC Development Assistance Committee
EADB East African Development Bank

EBRD European Bank for Reconstruction and Development ECAFE UN Economic Commission for Asia and the Far East

ECB European Central Bank

ECHR European Court of Human Rights

ECLA UN Economic Commission for Latin America
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council of the United Nations

xxii Abbreviations

EDB Eurasian Development Bank
EEC European Economic Union
EIB European Investment Bank

ESCWA UN Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia

ESMA European Securities and Markets Authority

EU European Union

EURATOM European Atomic Energy Community Treaty
EuroLat Euro-Latin American Parliamentary Assembly

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization

FOPREL Forum of the Presidents of the Legislative Powers of Central

America

FSB Financial Stability Board FSF Financial Stability Forum

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

Gavi Alliance Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization

GCF Green Climate Fund

GEF Global Environment Facility

General Convention Convention on the Privileges and Immunities of the United

**Nations** 

GET Global Environment Trust

GIZ Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit
Global Fund Global Fund to Fight Aids, Tuberculosis and Malaria

GMBH Gesellschaft mit beschränkter Haftung HIPC Heavily Indebted Poor Countries

HRC Human Rights Committee

IADB Inter-American Development Bank IAEA International Atomic Energy Agency

IAIS International Association of Insurance Supervisors

IANA Internet Assigned Numbers Authority
IATA International Air Transport Association
IAU International Administrative Unions

IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development ICANN Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers

ICAO International Civil Aviation Organization

ICC International Criminal Court ICJ International Court of Justice

ICPC International Criminal Police Commission
ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross
IDA International Development Association

IFAD International Fund for Agricultural Development IFFIm International Finance Facility for Immunisation

IFI International Financial Institutions
IGO Intergovernmental Organizations
ILA International Law Association
ILC International Law Commission

Abbreviations xxiii

ILO International Labour Organization
 IMF International Monetary Fund
 IMO International Maritime Organization

INGO International Nongovernmental Organization INMARSAT International Maritime Satellite Organization

INTELSAT International Telecommunications Satellite Organization

INTERPOL International Criminal Police Origination

IO International Organization

IOIA International Organizations Immunity Act IOM International Organization for Migration

IOSCO International Organization of Securities Commissions

IPPC International Plant Protection Convention

IPU Inter-Parliamentary Union

IRENA International Renewable Energy Agency IRO International Refugee Organization IRRI International Rice Research Institute

ISDB Islamic Development Bank

ISFD Islamic Solidarity Fund for Development ISO International Organization for Standardization

ISSB International Standard-Setting Bodies

ITC International Tin Council ITO International Trade Organization

ITU International Telecommunication Union

IUOTO International Union for Official Tourism Organizations

KFW Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau MDB Multilateral Development Bank MOU Memorandum of Understanding NDB New Development Bank

NDF Nordic Development Fund
NGO Nongovernmental Organization
OAS Organization of American States
ODA Official Development Assistance

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

OIE World Organisation for Animal Health
OLA United Nations Office of Legal Affairs

OPCW Organization for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons
OPEC Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries
OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PAIGH Pan American Institute for Geography and History

PCT Patent Cooperation Treaty
PRC People's Republic of China
QAB Quasi-autonomous Bodies

REIO Regional Economic Integration Organization

SBI Subsidiary Body of Implementation SCPI South Caucasus Parliamentary Initiative xxiv Abbreviations

SITA Societé Internationale de Telecommunications

Aeronautiques

TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

TNC Transnational Corporations

UN United Nations

UNCCD United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNESCAP UN Economic Commission for Asia and the Pacific UNFCCC United Nations Framework Agreement on Climate Change

UN-HABITAT United Nations Human Settlement Programme

UNHCR UN High Commissioner for Refugees

UNICEF United Nations Children Fund

UNIDO United Nations Industrial Development Organization
UNIFEM United Nations Development Fund for Women

UNMIK United Nations Interim Administration Mission in Kosovo

UNPF United Nations Population Fund

UNRWA United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine

Refugees in the Near East

UNU United Nations University
UNWTO World Tourism Organization
UPU Universal Postal Union

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

VCLTIO Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties between States

and International Organizations or Between International

Organizations

WADB West African Development Bank
WCO World Customs Organization
WFP World Food Programme
WHO World Health Organization

WIPO World Intellectual Property Organization
WMO World Meteorological Organization

WTO World Trade Organization